

Massachusetts Premises Liability

Table of Contents

Chapter 1

PREMISES GAS AND FIRE LIABILITY

Part I: The Plaintiff's Perspective

WARREN F. FITZGERALD, ESQ.

Meehan, Boyle & Cohen, P.C., Boston

§ 1.1 INTRODUCTION

§ 1.2 ANALYSIS OF A FIRE CASE

§ 1.2.1 Cause and Origin

§ 1.2.2 Duty to Prevent Fire

§ 1.2.3 Duty to Suppress Fire

Part II: The Defense Perspective

ROBERT A. CURLEY, JR, ESQ.

Curley & Curley, P.C., Boston

§ 1.3 INTRODUCTION

§ 1.4 THE SCENE

§ 1.5 PRESERVATION OF THE EVIDENCE

§ 1.5.1 Documentation of the Fire in Progress

§ 1.6 BECOMING EDUCATED IN FIRE SCIENCE

§ 1.6.1 Definitions

§ 1.6.2 The Elements of a Fire

§ 1.6.3 The Elements of an Explosion

§ 1.6.4 Identifying Possible Causes

§ 1.6.5 Determining Whether the Fire Could Have Been Prevented

§ 1.6.6 Checklist for Review of Building Department File

§ 1.7 OBTAINING ACCESS TO THE PREMISES

§ 1.7.1 Photographing the Scene

§ 1.7.2 Complaint for Discovery

§ 1.8 Identifying Key Personnel

§ 1.8.1 Emergency Personnel

§ 1.8.2 Owners, Lessors and Other Potential Parties to Litigation

§ 1.8.3 Experts

§ 1.9 IDENTIFYING THEORIES OF CAUSE

§ 1.9.1 Identifying Exemplars of Products

§ 1.9.2 Preserving Damaged Property

§ 1.10 LITIGATION CONSIDERATIONS FOR THE DEFENSE

§ 1.10.1 Requests for Production of Documents and Inspection of Premises

§ 1.10.2 Deposition Practice Checklist

§ 1.10.3 Other Trial Considerations

(a) Motion in Limine

(b) Motions to Bifurcate

EXHIBIT 1A—Plaintiffs' First Set of Requests for Production of Documents to Defendant

EXHIBIT 1B—Notice of Taking Deposition

EXHIBIT 1C—Plaintiffs' Interrogatories Propounded to the Defendant

EXHIBIT 1D—Plaintiffs' Interrogatories to be Answered by Defendant

EXHIBIT 1E—Plaintiffs' Request for Production of Documents to Defendant

EXHIBIT 1F—Plaintiffs' Third Request for Production of Documents to Defendant

EXHIBIT 1G—Plaintiffs' Fifth Request for Production of Documents to Defendant

EXHIBIT 1H—First Request for Production of Documents to Defendant

EXHIBIT 1I—First Set of Interrogatories of Plaintiff to Defendant

EXHIBIT 1J—Plaintiff's First Set of Interrogatories to the Defendant

EXHIBIT 1K—Plaintiff's First Request for Production of Documents to the Defendant

EXHIBIT 1L—Plaintiff’s Interrogatories Propounded to the Defendant

EXHIBIT 1M—Notice of Taking Deposition

EXHIBIT 1N—Plaintiff’s 30(b)(6) Notice of Deposition

EXHIBIT 1O—Answer and Jury Claim of Defendant

EXHIBIT 1P—Defendant’s First Set of Interrogatories to the Plaintiff

EXHIBIT 1Q—Defendant’s First Request for Production of Documents to the Plaintiff

EXHIBIT 1R—Motion in Limine of Defendant to Exclude or Redact Portions of Fire Incident Report

EXHIBIT 1S—Defendant’s Motion in Limine Re: Exclusion of a Specific Report

EXHIBIT 1T—Motion in Limine of Defendant Re: Evidence of Other Incidents

EXHIBIT 1U—Defendant’s Motion to Bifurcate Trial

EXHIBIT 1V—Defendant’s Request for Additional Voir Dire Questions

EXHIBIT 1W—Defendant’s First Requests for Instructions to the Jury

EXHIBIT 1X—Defendant’s Requests for Instructions Re: Damage

EXHIBIT 1Y—Defendant’s Supplemental Requests for Instructions Re: Duty to Warn

EXHIBIT 1Z—Defendant’s Request for Supplemental Instructions to the Jury

EXHIBIT 1AA—Defendant’s First Requests for Instructions to the Jury

Chapter 2
NEGLIGENT SECURITY

JEFFREY A. NEWMAN, ESQ.
Newman & Beeler, P.C., Boston

Part I: Proving Foreseeability

§ 2.1 INTRODUCTION

§ 2.2 PROVING FORESEEABILITY OF CRIME IN NEGLIGENT SECURITY CASES

§ 2.3 ESTABLISHING FORESEEABILITY THROUGH THE EVIDENCE

§ 2.4 CREATING AN INVESTIGATIVE PLAN

§ 2.4.1 Prior Incidents of Criminal Activity: Checklist for Investigation

§ 2.4.2 Scope of the Investigation

§ 2.4.3 Crime Trends

§ 2.4.4 Criminal Conviction Records

§ 2.4.5 Retaining an Investigator

§ 2.5 HOSPITAL NEGLIGENT SECURITY

§ 2.5.1 Identifying All Potential Defendants in a Hospital Setting

§ 2.5.2 Psychiatric Wards

§ 2.5.3 Locating Past Employees

§ 2.5.4 The Hospital Parking Lot

§ 2.5.5 Hospital Windows

§ 2.6 HOTEL NEGLIGENT SECURITY

§ 2.6.1 Determining Point of Entry into Hotel

§ 2.6.2 Comparative Negligence of Hotel Patrons

§ 2.6.3 Employee Crime Against Hotel Patrons

§ 2.7 NEGLIGENT HOME SECURITY

§ 2.7.1 Investigation of the Home Security Company

§ 2.8 CONCLUSION

Part II: Crimes of Violence and Civil Liability

§ 2.9 INTRODUCTION

§ 2.10 THE DUTY OF CARE

§ 2.10.1 Duty of a Common Carrier to Protect Its Patrons from Violence

(a) The Highest Degree of Care

(b) Protecting Passengers from the Violence of the Carrier's Servants—Strict Liability

§ 2.10.2 Duty Owed by Servers of Alcohol and Social Host Servers of Alcohol

(a) The Duty of a Social Host to Protect Guests from Attack by Others

§ 2.10.3 Duty Owed by Residential Landlords

§ 2.10.4 Duty Owed by Commercial Landlords

§ 2.10.5 Housing Authorities as Landlords

(a) Test to Determine Whether a Function Is Discretionary

(b) Recent Amendments to the Massachusetts Tort Claims Act

§ 2.10.6 Duty Owed to Trespassers to Protect Them from Attack

§ 2.10.7 Foreseeability

§ 2.10.8 Foreseeability of Third-Party Criminal Attacks

§ 2.10.9 Prior Criminal Activity

§ 2.10.10 Superseding Causes

§ 2.10.11 Deterrence

§ 2.11 Common Affirmative Defenses in Negligent Security Cases

§ 2.11.1 Comparative Negligence

(a) Comparative Negligence as Applied to Attacks Provoked or Instigated by the Plaintiff

(b) Comparative Negligence as Applied to Attacks Under Circumstances Where the Plaintiff Had Knowledge or Warning Concerning Potential Danger

(c) Disclaimer of Liability

(d) Mitigation of Damages

§ 2.12 Conclusion

APPENDIX 2A—Selected Negligent Security Cases

APPENDIX 2B—Related Cases and Commentaries

APPENDIX 2C—Closing Arguments

EXHIBIT 2A—Defendant’s Motion for Summary Judgment

EXHIBIT 2B—Memorandum of Law in Support of Defendant’s Motion for Summary Judgment

EXHIBIT 2C—Plaintiff’s Memorandum in Opposition to Defendant’s Motion for Summary Judgment

EXHIBIT 2D—Police Department’s Request for Deposition

EXHIBIT 2E—Police Department’s Motion for a Protective Order

EXHIBIT 2F—Police Department’s Memorandum in Support of Motion for a Protective Order

EXHIBIT 2G—Freedom of Information Act Request/Public Records Act Request

EXHIBIT 2H—Freedom of Information Act Request Involving Rape of a Female

EXHIBIT 2I—Denial of Freedom of Information Act Request Involving Rape of a Female

EXHIBIT 2J—Police Department’s Motion for a Protective Order

EXHIBIT 2K—Plaintiff’s Opposition to the Police Department’s Motion for a Protective Order

EXHIBIT 2L—Plaintiff’s Memorandum in Opposition to the Police Department’s Motion for a Protective Order

EXHIBIT 2M—Plaintiff’s Proposed Jury Instructions

EXHIBIT 2N—Plaintiff’s G.L. c. 93A Brief

EXHIBIT 2O—Plaintiff’s Opposition and Memorandum in Opposition of Defendant’s Motion for J.N.O.V. and for New Trial

Chapter 3 **WINDOW FALLS**

MARSHALL A. KAROL, ESQ.
Karol & Riley, PA, Boston

§ 3.1 Introduction

§ 3.2 Code of Massachusetts Regulations

§ 3.3 Liability of Manufacturers

§ 3.3.1 Manufacturer’s Duty

§ 3.3.2 Breach of Warranty

§ 3.4 Liability of Landlords

§ 3.4.1 Negligence

§ 3.4.2 Breach of Warranty

Chapter 4 **CHILD TRESPASSERS**

ROBERT W. CASBY, ESQ.
Sugarman & Sugarman, P.C., Boston

§ 4.1 INTRODUCTION

§ 4.2 RECOVERY UNDER THE CHILD TRESPASSER STATUTE, G.L. 231, § 85Q

§ 4.2.1 The Requirement of G.L. c. 231, § 85Q(a)

§ 4.2.2 The Requirement of G.L. c. 231, § 85Q(b)

§ 4.2.3 The Requirement of G.L. c. 231, § 85Q(c)

(a) Comparative Negligence of the Child

§ 4.2.4 The Requirement of G.L. c. 231, § 85Q(d)

§ 4.2.5 The Requirement of G.L. c. 231, § 85Q(e)

§ 4.3 JURISDICTIONAL SURVEY

§ 4.3.1 Age-Based Categories

§ 4.3.2 Condition-Based Categories

§ 4.4 MOVING TRAINS IN RELATION TO THE ATTRACTIVE NUISANCE DOCTRINE

§ 4.4.1 Jurisdictions Allowing Child Trespasser Case to Be Brought Against a Moving Train

§ 4.4.2 Jurisdictions Holding that Accidents to Child Trespassers Involving Moving Trains Fall Outside the Scope of the Attractive Nuisance Doctrine

§ 4.4.3 Moving Trains Outside the Scope of Restatement (Second) of Torts § 339 Because Element (c) Cannot Be Satisfied

§ 4.4.4 Moving Trains Outside Scope of Restatement (Second) of Torts § 339 Because Element (d) Cannot Be Satisfied

§ 4.4.5 The Common and Statutory Law on Moving Trains and Section 339 in California
APPENDIX 4A—Related Cases and Commentaries

Chapter 5
LEAD POISONING LIABILITY

MARK F. ITZKOWITZ, ESQ.
Law Offices of Mark F. Itzkowitz, Boston

Part I: The Plaintiff's Perspective

MARK F. ITZKOWITZ, ESQ.

Law Offices of Mark F. Itzkowitz, Boston

§ 5.1 INTRODUCTION

§ 5.2 LEAD LEVELS CONSTITUTING LEAD POISONING

§ 5.3 LEGISLATIVE RESPONSE

§ 5.4 WARNING TO PLAINTIFF'S PRACTITIONERS

§ 5.5 THE PLAINTIFF'S THEORIES OF LIABILITY

§ 5.6 PRE-1994 INJURIES

§ 5.7 VIOLATIONS OF THE STATE SANITARY CODE

§ 5.8 THE APPLICABILITY OF STRICT LIABILITY

§ 5.9 PROOF OF LEAD LEVEL

§ 5.10 PUNITIVE DAMAGES

§ 5.11 THE PLAINTIFF'S MOTION FOR SUMMARY JUDGMENT

§ 5.12 DAMAGES AND PROXIMATE CAUSE

§ 5.12.1 Future Damages

§ 5.13 BREACH OF THE COVENANT OF QUIET ENJOYMENT

§ 5.14 BREACH OF THE WARRANTY OF HABITABILITY

§ 5.15 NEGLIGENCE

§ 5.15.1 The Duty to Maintain the Premises in a Safe Condition

§ 5.15.2 The Plaintiff's Proof of Breach of the Duty of Care

§ 5.15.3 Proximate Cause and Damages

§ 5.16 VIOLATIONS OF THE MASSACHUSETTS CONSUMER COMPLAINT STATUTE

§ 5.17 LOSS OF CONSORTIUM

Part II: The Defense Perspective

GERALD T. ANGLIO, ESQ.

Tommasino & Tommasino, Boston

§ 5.18 Introduction

§ 5.19 The Certificate of Inspection

§ 5.20 Identifying the Lead on the Premises as the Lead in the Child

§ 5.21 Studies on the Effects of Lead: Models Useful for the Defense

§ 5.22 Alternative Sources of Lead: The Use of Summary Judgment

§ 5.23 DAUBERT'S Effect on Lead Liability

§ 5.24 Effects of Lead That Is Present in the Child's Blood

§ 5.25 Loss of IQ

§ 5.26 Lead in Soil: Evidentiary Value

§ 5.27 Transfer of Lead From Mother to Child

§ 5.28 Age of Child as a Factor in Lead Testing

APPENDIX 5A—Terms and Definitions

APPENDIX 5B—Checklist of Defenses in Lead Poisoning Cases

APPENDIX 5C—Checklist of Causes of Symptoms Nonspecific to Lead Poisoning

APPENDIX 5D—Checklist of Defenses to Damages Claims in Lead Poisoning Cases

APPENDIX 5E—Checklist for Consideration of Potential Third-Party Defendants

APPENDIX 5F—Checklist of Discovery Issues in Lead Poisoning Cases

APPENDIX 5G—Checklist of Defense Concerns in Lead Poisoning Cases

APPENDIX 5H—Checklist of Settlement Issues for Defense of Lead Poisoning Cases

APPENDIX 5I—Checklist of Trial Tactics for Defense of Lead Poisoning Cases

APPENDIX 5J—Recent Housing Court Summaries of Decisions on Summary Judgments

APPENDIX 5K—Letter of Compliance

APPENDIX 5L—Report of Inspector

EXHIBIT 5A—Plaintiff's Motion for Partial Summary Judgment on Liability

EXHIBIT 5B—Memorandum in Support of Plaintiff's Motion for Partial Summary Judgment

EXHIBIT 5C—Plaintiff's Request for Jury Instructions

EXHIBIT 5D—Plaintiff's Trial Brief

EXHIBIT 5E—Plaintiff's Trial Brief

EXHIBIT 5F—Plaintiff's Motion in Limine to Admit Lead Inspection Report

EXHIBIT 5G—Plaintiff's Brief in Support of Admissibility of Lead Inspection Report

EXHIBIT 5H—Plaintiff's Motion in Limine to Admit Blood Lead Level Results

EXHIBIT 5I—Plaintiff's Brief in Support of Admissibility of Blood Lead Levels

EXHIBIT 5J—Motion of Defendant in Support of Motion to Limit Testimony of Psychologist

Chapter 6

DRAMSHOP AND SOCIAL HOST LIABILITY

JAMES P. PONSETTO, ESQ.
Newman & Beeler, P.C., Boston

§ 6.1 OVERVIEW OF SOCIAL HOST LIABILITY

§ 6.1.1 Liability of Social Hosts Where Intoxicated Guest Operates a Motor Vehicle and Causes Injury to a Third Person

- (a) Parents Absent from Party
- (b) Parents Present, But Did Not Furnish or Serve Alcohol
- (c) "Permitting" a Party to Drink Versus "Serving the Party"
- (d) Employer-Host Relationship Distinguished

§ 6.1.2 Liability of Social Hosts Where Intoxicated Guest Operates a Motor Vehicle and Causes Injury to Himself or Herself

§ 6.1.3 Liability of Social Host Where Intoxicated Guest Causes Injury to a Third Person Other Than as a Result of Operating a Motor Vehicle

§ 6.2 OVERVIEW OF LIABILITY OF TAVERNS, BARS AND COMMERCIAL ESTABLISHMENTS

§ 6.2.1 Liability Where Intoxicated Patron Operates a Motor Vehicle and Causes Injury to a Third Person

- (a) Applicability of Cimino to Liquor Vendors

§ 6.2.2 Liability Where Intoxicated Patron Causes Injury to Himself or Herself

§ 6.2.3 Liability Where Intoxicated Patron Causes Injury to a Third Person Other Than as a Result of Operating a Motor Vehicle

§ 6.2.4 Liability Where Alcoholic Beverages Are Not Served, Furnished, Made Available, Sold or Delivered

§ 6.2.5 Special Care Required to Avoid Service of Alcohol to Minors

§ 6.2.6 Evidence of Intoxication at the Time of Service

§ 6.2.7 Wrongful Death Actions—Decedent's Negligence APPENDIX 6A—Checklist for Dramshop and Social Host Liability

APPENDIX 6B—Checklist for Deposition of Companion of Intoxicated Person

Chapter 7 SLIP AND FALL

ROLAND SEGALINI, JR., ESQ.
Segalini & Neville, Waltham

§ 7.1 INTRODUCTION

§ 7.2 THE STANDARD SET BY MOUNSEY v. ELLARD

§ 7.3 COMMUNITY STANDARDS

§ 7.4 TRESPASSERS

§ 7.5 SLIP AND FALL DUE TO DEFECT ON THE PREMISES OF ANOTHER

§ 7.6 TIME ELEMENT IN PLAINTIFF'S CASE

§ 7.7 CASE LAW SINCE MOUNSEY

§ 7.8 SNOW AND ICE

§ 7.8.1 Notice Requirements in Snow and Ice Cases

§ 7.8.2 Summary Judgment Relief

§ 7.9 MUNICIPALITIES

§ 7.10 COMPARATIVE NEGLIGENCE

§ 7.11 CONCLUSION EXHIBIT 7A—Motion for Summary Judgment of the Defendant

EXHIBIT 7B—Defendant's Memorandum in Support of Motion for Summary Judgment

EXHIBIT 7C—Interrogatories Propounded by the Defendant to Be Answered by the Plaintiff

EXHIBIT 7D—Defendant’s Request for Production of Documents from the Plaintiff

Chapter 8
CONSTRUCTION SITE LIABILITY

ANTHONY TARRICONE, ESQ.
Sarrouf, Tarricone & Flemming, Boston

§ 8.1 Introduction

§ 8.2 Checklist of Construction Site Accidents Giving Rise to Third-Party Liability Claims

§ 8.3 General Theories of Liability

§ 8.3.1 Negligence

§ 8.3.2 Breach of Warranty

§ 8.4 Potential Defendants and Causes of Action

§ 8.4.1 Cause of Action Checklist for Construction Site Litigation

§ 8.5 Liability for Construction Site Injury Claims

§ 8.5.1 Vicarious Liability of the General Contractor

§ 8.5.2 Liability Based on General Contractor’s Retention of Control

§ 8.5.3 Application of Corsetti to Recent Massachusetts Cases

(a) *Dilaveris v. W. T. Rich Co.*

(b) *Cheschi v. Boston Edison Co.*

(c) *Holder v. Gilbane Building Co.*

§ 8.6 Landowner Liability

§ 8.7 Proof of Negligence

§ 8.8 Legal Principles Relating to the Evidentiary Use of Codes, Customs, Standards and Regulations

§ 8.8.1 Safety Practices

§ 8.8.2 Written Standards

§ 8.8.3 Safety Statute or Ordinance

§ 8.8.4 Massachusetts Regulations

§ 8.8.5 Related Cases

§ 8.8.6 Checklist for Researching Primary Sources (Standards, Regulations, Codes and Other Documents and Sources)

§ 8.9 Checklist for Obtaining Documents Through Discovery EXHIBIT 8A—Answers of Defendant to Second Set of Interrogatories Propounded by the Plaintiff

EXHIBIT 8B—Interrogatories Propounded by the Defendant to Be Answered Under Oath by the Plaintiff

EXHIBIT 8C—Third-Party Defendant's Request for Production of Documents to the Plaintiff

EXHIBIT 8D—Defendant's First Request for Production of Documents to Plaintiff

EXHIBIT 8E—Defendant's First Set of Interrogatories to Plaintiff

EXHIBIT 8F—First Set of Interrogatories Propounded by the Third Party to Be Answered by the Third Defendant

EXHIBIT 8G—Notice of Taking Deposition

EXHIBIT 8H—Deposition Subpoena

EXHIBIT 8I—Mass.R.Civ.P. 30(b)(6) Notice of Taking Deposition of the Defendant

EXHIBIT 8J—Mass.R.Civ.P. 30(b)(6) Notice of Taking Deposition of the Defendant

EXHIBIT 8K—Four Various Motions in Limine

EXHIBIT 8L—Defendant's Motion in Limine Requesting the Court to Allow Defendant to Use Diagrams or Photographs Not Yet in Evidence During the Opening Statement

EXHIBIT 8M—Motion of the Defendant to Preclude from Offering Any Expert Opinions

EXHIBIT 8N—Motion of the Defendant for a Directed Verdict Made at the Close of the Plaintiff's Evidence

EXHIBIT 8O—Request of the Defendant for Instructions to the Jury

EXHIBIT 8P—Motion of the Defendant for a New Trial, or in the Alternative, Remittitur

EXHIBIT 8Q—Memorandum of Law in Support of the Motion of the Defendant for a New Trial, or in the Alternative, Remittitur

Chapter 9
GOVERNMENT ENTITIES

MARTIN J. ROONEY
Curley & Curley, P.C., Boston

§ 9.1 Introduction

§ 9.2 Scope

§ 9.3 Notice

§ 9.3.1 What Must Be Stated in Notice Letter

§ 9.4 Jurisdictional Issues

§ 9.5 Statutory Settlement Cap

§ 9.6 Insurance

§ 9.7 Contract Claims

§ 9.8 Immunity

§ 9.8.1 Intentional Torts

§ 9.8.2 Discretionary Function Doctrine

§ 9.8.3 Public Duties

§ 9.8.4 Licensing

(a) Inspections

§ 9.8.5 Fire and Police Departments

§ 9.9 Direct Assurances of Safety

§ 9.10 Indemnification

§ 9.11 Miscellaneous Liability Notes

APPENDIX 9A—Motion for Summary Judgment

EXHIBIT 9A—Defendant’s Memorandum of Its Motion for Summary Judgment

EXHIBIT 9B—Plaintiffs’ Memorandum in Opposition to Defendant’s Motion for Summary Judgment

EXHIBIT 9C—Memorandum of Defendants in Opposition to Defendant’s Motion for Summary Judgment

Chapter 10
INSURANCE COVERAGE FOR PREMISES LIABILITY

STEVEN L. SCHRECKINGER, ESQ.

Palmer & Dodge, LLP, Boston §

10.1 PRELIMINARY CONSIDERATIONS: THE IMPORTANCE OF *THALER v. AMERICAN INSURANCE COMPANY*

§ 10.1.1 The Thaler Demand Letter

§ 10.1.2 Instances in Which Thaler Does Not Apply

§ 10.2 THE ROLE OF THE PLAINTIFF'S LAWYER

§ 10.2.1 Checklist for Determining Coverage

§ 10.2.2 Notice

§ 10.2.3 Notice to Multiple Policies

§ 10.3 THE PREJUDICE REQUIREMENT

§ 10.4 THE DUTY TO DEFEND; STERILITE'S BROAD SCOPE

§ 10.4.1 Effect of Plaintiff's Theory of the Case on the Duty to Defend

§ 10.4.2 The Reservation of Rights and the Duty to Defend

§ 10.5 THE INSURED'S RIGHT TO SELECT COUNSEL

§ 10.6 THE DUTY TO INDEMNIFY

§ 10.6.1 The Requirement of "Bodily Injury"

§ 10.6.2 Loss of Consortium

§ 10.7 OCCURRENCES

§ 10.7.1 Intentional Acts Distinguished from Expected or Intended Acts

§ 10.7.2 Evidence of Inability to Form Requisite Intent

§ 10.8 COMMONLY LITIGATED EXCLUSIONS IN THE HOMEOWNER'S POLICY

§ 10.8.1 "Insured vs Insured" Exclusion

§ 10.8.2 Automobile Exclusion

§ 10.8.3 Pollution Exclusion

§ 10.8.4 Business Pursuits Exclusion

§ 10.8.5 Exclusions in General

§ 10.9 LIMITS OF LIABILITY—HOW MUCH COVERAGE IS AVAILABLE?

§ 10.9.1 Consortium Claims

§ 10.9.2 Multiple Claimants

§ 10.9.3 Stacking Multiple Years of Coverage